



**Scottish Rural
Development
Programme**



**TYNE ESK LAG MEETING MINUTES
10th May 2018, 09:15am – 3.30pm
Humbie Village Hall, Kippithill, Humbie, East Lothian**

LAG Members Present

Andrew McDonald, (AM), Edinburgh Butterfly World, LAG Chair
 Anne Hastie, (AH), Private Individual, LAG Vice Chair
 Andrew Bayne-Jardine, (AB) Private Individual, LAG member
 Cheryl Brown, (CB), Midlothian Sure Start, LAG member
 Frank Beattie, (FB), Scottish Enterprise, LAG member
 Jane Burridge, (JB) Gorebridge Community Development Trust, LAG member
 Sandra Duncan, (AD), Scottish Women’s Rural Institute (SWRI), LAG member
 Provost John McMillan, (JM), East Lothian Council, LAG member
 Simon Poole, (SP), Jerba Campervans, LAG member
 Hilary Smith, (HS), North Berwick Coastal Area Partnership, LAG member
 Yvonne Stoddart, (YS), STRiVE, LAG member

LAG Observers Present

Susan Smith, (SS), East Lothian Council, LAG Observer

Staff Members Present

Joy Godfrey, (JG), LEADER Support Assistant, LEADER Team (notes)
 Lesley Gordon, (LG), LEADER Project Officer, LEADER Team
 Angela Lamont, (AL), LEADER Project Officer, LEADER Team
 Neil Ramsay, (NR), LEADER Programme Co-ordinator, LEADER Team
 Rebecca Spolander, (RS), LEADER Support

Apologies

Karen Calvert, (KC), Papermill Restaurant, LAG member
 Claire Gilles, (CG) Penicuik YMCA -YWCA, LAG member
 Cllr Russell Imrie, (RI), Midlothian Council, LAG member
 Patrick Playfair, (PP) Edwin Thompson, LAG member
 Alasdair Mathers, (AMA), Midlothian Community Planning Partnership, LAG Observer
 Dawne Milligan, (DM), LEADER Finance Support Officer, LEADER Team
 Paolo Vestri, (PV), East Lothian Partnership, LAG Observer

Welcome and Apologies	Actions
<p>AM welcomed everyone to the meeting and declared the meeting quorate, with 11 members in attendance of which two were from the public sector.</p> <p>Apologies were noted as above.</p>	



1. Matters Arising From Minutes

NR reported that AM, AH, NR, SP & one of SP’s Jerba Campervans colleagues had attended the Scottish Rural Awards where Jerba Campervans was nominated in the category “Rural Employer”.

2. Feedback on Scottish Government Developments

NR noted the debate in the Scottish Parliament, where Mairi Gougeon MSP led a motion to ask Michael Gove MP for LEADER to be retained and the funds continued from the UK Treasury, which was passed.

NR & RS had attended an event to celebrate the achievement of Perth and Kinross LEADER with an opportunity to lobby the Scottish Government on behalf of LEADER LAGs. NR noted that Tyne Esk LEADER could replicate this event or get involved in Perth and Kinross LEADER’s lobbying subgroup – which they welcomed.

NR to contact Perth & Kinross LEADER

3. Update on:

3.1 Staffing

The LAG wished Project Officer LG all the best in her role with a new employer and AM, AH & NR had agreed not to seek a replacement due to the LAG being close to being fully committed by the time a new project officer would be appointed.

RS’s 15 week internship is soon to end.

John Anzani (JA) has resigned so the LEADER team is seeking a new Accountable Body representative. The Head of Service has also announced an intention to retire. One of JA’s responsibilities was to check and submit drawdowns to the Scottish Government. The LAG agreed to check if one of Midlothian Council’s accountant’s would be able to undertake this.

NR to ask for an accountant’s help

3.2 Budget

There is £1.2m allocated, with c. £500,000 left ring-fenced for farm diversification and co-operation projects and c. £42,000 left for community and third sector applications. There is an anticipated underspend on admin of c. £100k. The LAG was confident in being able to meet the co-operation target and believed a few further farm diversification projects would see that target met.

3.3 GDPR Governance Meeting

NR reported back from a meeting of the LAG Governance subgroup. In summary:

Data Tyne Esk LEADER holds is:

- Information on LARCS
- Paper files
- Information in Midlothian Council’s mainframe
- Scoring Information on the Tyne Esk LEADER website
- Expressions of Interest



Recommendations to mitigate liability include:

- **LARCS** – Add text to Fair Processing Notice to make it GDPR compliant. Ensure all existing and future applications upload this to LARCS.
- The Existing Service Level Agreement and Data Sharing Agreement suggest that the Scottish Government are the data controllers for LARCS so they are liable for this data.
- **Paper files** – No longer print out paper files but only retain things that are signed for, sensitive data like accounts and bank statements and claim information in hard copy.
- Write this into a Storage and Archiving Policy including that we no longer take these files outside of the office
- Store project plans for applications on Tyne Esk website
- Continue to keep paper files locked away
- **Info on Midlothian Council’s Mainframe** – no action required as is GDPR compliant
- **Scoring information** – Anonymise everyone’s scores
- Add new privacy statement to the website
- Ensure LAG members only change scores at the LAG meeting so that there is an audit trail
- **Expression of Interest Information** – Put the EOI spreadsheet on the website and ask LAG members to comment directly

LAG members asked for the documents on the website to be ‘view only’ rather than automatically downloaded / downloadable. NR to ask IT how to make this possible. The LAG discussed password-protecting individual files.

Other recommendations were:

- To use the Tyne Esk LEADER website more for LAG papers and appeal/complaints information
- Review user IT guidelines in the group protocol to include a list of what we consider sensitive and non-sensitive
- LEADER staff to make their diaries private to people outside of the LEADER team
- Only publicise general area we’re travelling to rather than the specific place / applicant
- Update the risk register with new information security tab
- Collect much of the above in an internal Information Security Policy

3.4 Projects

It was noted that the agenda was very full so it was agreed to move ‘project updates’ to AOB.

NR to action all GDPR actions, including make documents ‘read online’ and protected

AH to update risk register on GDPR LEADER team – to update Data protection practice



Scottish Rural Development Programme



3.5 Appeal Meeting

NR summarised that there had been three reasons for the LAG rejecting Newhall Exclusive Use Wedding Venue. The reasons for rejection at the last LAG were:

- The LAG had not seen the accounts and do could not assess Value For Money
- The lack of accounts meant the LAG were unable to assess additionality
- The LAG considered the amount requested high against the number and depth of outcomes delivered.

The submitted appeal was based on the reason ‘a misunderstanding of the facts’. The applicant had then submitted a statement of account indicating a small turnover and documentation showing that the custom was primarily family and friends and so additionality and value for money could be evidenced. The appeal meeting was attended by AMS and SS who felt that there were grounds for the LAG to revisit their decision, hence the application being re-assessed today.

3.6 Rebecca’s Time with LEADER

RS gave a presentation on her time with LEADER. In particular she mentioned the range of events, meetings, in situs and workshops she had enjoyed and which gave insight into how an organisation works to help deliver rural community development outcomes. The placement had also improved her written and verbal communication in English and the LAG was grateful for her work on creating a series of case studies for the website.

4 Assess Applications

4.1 The Cornerstone Project

This project is to renovate the Newbattle Parish Church building to enable it to better function as a ‘cornerstone’ community facility. The building will be flexible offering a community hub and café with soft play, a thrift shop and meeting space hire.

The LAG appreciated that the project was all-inclusive in being open to all community members in an area where the library and leisure centre are being relocated. The LAG liked that there was a ‘users working group’ made up of representatives from local peer organisations to monitor and manage the timetables of use of the building by the community.

The LAG felt that the high level of competence of the applicant project team was evident in the application and, again, during the site visit.



**Scottish Rural
Development
Programme**



The LAG considered the project very innovative for the community and area.

The issue of the present 'rationalisation' of Church of Scotland property was raised and whether Newbattle Parish Church had any prospect of facing this. It was felt that the Church of Scotland had also invested too much in this project to expect this to happen. It was also noted that permission for the project to operate for the minimum time period had been included in the application.

The Technical Check recommended the project for approval, subject to the match funding being secured.

Score

The LAG overall score for the project was 7, which will be entered into LARCS.

Vote

The LAG voted unanimously in favour of awarding a grant to the project of £90,000.00 subject to standard conditions plus confirmation of match funding.

Declaration of Interest

JM declared an interest in St Mary's Haddington – Lighting Project and JM and SS left. The LAG remained quorate with 10 LAG members in the room, 1 of whom from the public sector.

4.2 St Mary's Haddington – Lighting Project

This project is the installation of new LED lighting in St Mary's Church, Haddington, including architectural lighting which will be used to highlight the stained glass windows, archways and vaulted ceiling. The installation will be innovative as split cabling will be recessed into mortar with no visibility. The improved light levels will vastly improve the user experience – both for local community groups who use the building and for visitors. The LED lights will create efficiency savings with reduced energy consumption and increased run life.

The LAG agreed that the innovative aspect of the project was the LED lighting being very unusual in the Tyne Esk area. They appreciated that use of this would avoid the need to use a cherry-picker to change lightbulbs – as is the practice at present.

The LAG liked that the Church had done most of the fundraising for the pilot project which had lit an archway, a stained glass window, pillars and a stone pulpit so that the congregation and members of the public could see what the lighting project improvements might look like.



Scottish Rural
Development
Programme



The LAG discussed additionality and whether there were other funds available that could fund this. It was noted that most of the match was coming from the organisations resources, which was a sum raised through the sale of the manse. There was a small building fabric fund available but this was clearly for repairs and maintenance. Otherwise, there is no central fund for building improvements, as shown in the Funder of Last Resort Form. It was also noted that the intervention rate asked for is only 22.04% and so is leveraging a large sum for the area.

The LAG discussed whether this project is a priority for the community. The application stated the lighting would make the church much more accessible to a wide range of current and future community activities. The church is already well-used by the community but has the capacity to accommodate additional activities.

The Technical Check noted no issues. The technical check recommended the application for approval subject to the final match funding being confirmed and provision of a list of directors for the church.

Score

The LAG overall score for the project was 6, which will be entered into LARCS.

Vote

The LAG voted unanimously in favour of awarding a grant to the project of £75,000.00 subject to standard conditions and provision of confirmation of match funding.

Declaration of Interest

JM and SS returned to the LAG meeting making attendance at 11 LAG members with 2 from the public sector.

4.3 Melville Golf Centre

This project will refurbish and develop a family golf centre, making the business more attractive to families as well as golfers. The proposed Tyne Esk LEADER aspect of the project is to pay for the hire of a pair of robots to collect golf balls from the driving range and cut the grass, to renovate the driving range with improved targets and to implement a marketing strategy.

It was enquired as to whether having the robots would reduce employment through the lack of a need for someone to collect balls and cut grass. It was noted that the applicant intends to redeploy the staff member to other areas and so employment would not be reduced.



Scottish Rural
Development
Programme



The LAG liked the level of innovation of the project. They noted that the centre already uses automatic tees which rise up out of mats to adjustable heights and that if the funding from Tyne Esk LEADER goes ahead the applicant will upgrade the power tees.

It was felt the project had strong environmental benefits. The robots will keep the grass healthier by not compacting the ground like the tractor, they will also collect all the balls, rather than embedding many of them into the ground as the tractor did. The applicant noted that there were ducks on the golf course and they would be less disturbed by the robots than the tractor. Use of the robots would save on fuel and reduce the use of pesticides in the grass by cutting the grass more frequently.

It was further noted that by avoiding crushing balls into the ground the business would save on the cost of golf balls.

It was felt that the robots would be a unique selling point for the business and likely to attract interest from people keen to see the robots.

The funding would also cover a new marketing strategy, develop the brand and include signage and banners, and improve the website, which is 10 years old. The LAG felt that the cost of the marketing strategy was low, and that the applicant showed commitment to the Bots by intending to pay for three years of their lease himself.

It was noted that there is a need for driving ranges which are marketed more for women, boys and families to get more people into the sport – which Melville Golf Centre is aiming to do. Melville Golf Centre has coaching classes and is used by local schools as part of the Active Schools programme and by local nurseries. There are no other family golf centres in the Tyne Esk area.

Technical Check

The technical check recommended the project for approval subject to provision of title deeds.

Score

The LAG overall score for the project was 6, which will be entered into LARCS.

Vote

The LAG voted by a majority vote in favour of awarding a grant to the project of £40,138.80 subject to the specific conditions of producing title deeds to evidence control of asset

Recommendations:



The LAG additionally requested the applicant be recommended to take advice on marketing from either MTBAG, Business Gateway and similar in order to market Melville Golf Centre to best effect.

Declaration of Interest

CB declared an interest, as she is the applicant, and left the meeting, which remained quorate with 10 LAG members present, 2 of whom from the public sector.

4.4 Midlothian Sure Start

This project is to create a two year post for a Fundraising and Communications Officer to help develop a strategy to future-proof Midlothian Sure Start (MSS). MSS aims to deliver flexible childcare to meet the needs of the communities they work with in the deprived areas of Midlothian. MSS is facing funding cuts and sought to diversify its income streams with the recruitment of a Fundraising and Communications Officer being key to this.

It was noted that MSS’s funding has been severely cut while the Scottish Government’s requirement for childcare provision is set to increase significantly.

Other routes to sustainability were suggested such as creating a social enterprise, it was noted that MSS already have a trading arm that channels profits into the charity. This project is intended as a catalyst to build on this.

The LAG noted that fundraising can come from foundations, trusts, individuals, statutory bodies and the community. It was felt that the job description is very broad and, as a result, slightly unfocussed and difficult for only one person to manage. It was felt that the result is likely that the post holder will likely concentrate on areas of most success rather than on all elements of the job description.

It was felt to be innovative for a relatively small organisation to have a dedicated fundraising officer.

The LAG wondered if two years of funding would be long enough to make a difference. It was noted that this project will help to upskill existing staff to fundraise and manage projects in future giving the organisation a legacy.

Technical Check

The Technical Check recommended the project for approval subject to standard conditions.

Score



Scottish Rural
Development
Programme



The LAG overall score for the project was 7, which will be entered into LARCS.

Vote

The LAG voted by a majority in favour of awarding a grant to the project of £40,993.71 subject to standard conditions.

Quorum

JM and SS gave their apologies and departed the meeting for the day. CB returned. The LAG remained quorate with 10 LAG members, 1 from the public sector.

4.5 Newhall Exclusive Use Wedding Venue

NR summarised the grounds for appeal by the applicant, the production of accounts and the number of weddings to date providing strong evidence of additionality, which was missing when the LAG last assessed the application. It was noted that the cost of the project had come down due to planning permission for an awning on part of the building not being granted and so that cost being unnecessary.

It was questioned how the marketing would be done as there was little information in the application on this considering the niche target market and the rapid increase in bookings anticipated.

The LAG noted the many letters of support from support industries nearby showing the spin-off benefit that 30 or 40 weddings per year in the area would bring as well as the creation of good quality jobs.

Melville Castle and Dalhousie Castle are other wedding venues in the area but it was felt that this facility, as with most upmarket wedding venues would be competing on a wider regional basis and so close geography was not so important. Newhall would also be wholly booked with farm more bedrooms than other venues in Tyne Esk and so would be have a much higher price point than other venues in Tyne Esk.

Technical Check

The Technical Check recommended the project for approval subject to providing refreshed tender without the awning.

Score

The LAG overall score for the project was 6, which will be entered into LARCS.

Vote

The LAG voted unanimously in favour , with three abstentions, of awarding a grant to the project of £113,277.00 subject to specific conditions of the



Scottish Rural
Development
Programme



applicant providing three new quotes for the work and provision of a marketing plan to be assessed by three LAG members, AM, SP and FB .

Quorum

AH gave her apologies and left. The LAG remained quorate with 9 LAG members, 1 from the public sector.

4.6 Garleton Lodge Cookery School

This project is for £70,000.00 to extend Garleton Lodge, a luxury bed & breakfast / small hotel and restaurant to house a new Cookery School including enlarged kitchen and breakout area. The project aimed to diversify and support the development of the existing business.

Anticipated benefits include creating four new jobs and safeguarding six existing jobs. The project also intended to enable training courses to be provided for the local community – particularly young people – enabling new skills to be developed thereby enhancing their opportunity to secure local employment. Building on this community benefit, the project also promised to deliver more hosting of local community groups free of charge. The applicant also wished to use the business to showcase locally sourced ingredients, anticipating that this would provide East Lothian food & drink producers with further business and exposure to a wider audience with associated economic and job related benefits.

The LAG were concerned about the affordability of the cookery courses for the community when the provision is intended to be very high end. It was noted during the site visit that Brownies and Guides would receive free training courses but the application stated employability benefits and the LAG felt evidence of this was not strong, particularly for those most in need, such as the unemployed.

It was also noted that there would be no ovens for people to do their own cooking as only hobs were being installed. There was a feeling that the project could more accurately be described as creating a demonstration room than a cookery school.

The LAG agreed that the Funder of Last Resort form did not adequately show that LEADER was the funder of last resort..

The current and projected accounts did not split out salary costs so there was widespread confusion as to the value of the existing and anticipated jobs to be created. It was noted that the site visit clarified that some were at present unpaid, which suggested that some of the jobs were, currently at least, of low value.



<p>There was a concern over displacement of Coulston House, which also offers a cookery school. The application stated that Garleton Lodge worked in partnership with Coulston but there was no other evidence of this working partnership.</p> <p>Quorum CB left at this point. The LAG remained quorate with 9 LAG members in attendance, 1 from the public sector.</p> <p>Technical Check The project was recommended for rejection. The reasons, and LAG discussion of such were as follows:</p> <p>Score: The LAG overall score for the project was 5.2, which will be entered into LARCS.</p> <p>Vote: The LAG voted unanimously in favour of rejecting the application. The reasons for rejection were noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The LAG felt that the project did not evidence that it would deliver against the Local Development Strategy enough for the investment • The LAG felt there was a lack of clarity around some of the elements of the project, specifically: • Additionality • Return on Investment • Training Opportunities 	
<p>5 AOB 5.1 Project Updates The LAG agreed that change requests could be agreed electronically – these involve extensions and single tender requests. NR to communicate with the LAG re this and any other project updates.</p>	<p>NR to contact LAG</p>
<p>4 Finish – Date of next meeting Thursday 9th August 2018 , Scottish Mining Museum</p>	

W. [Signature]
 Chair - 9/8/18

